PUBLIC-FACING BIOMETRICS AT PORT FACILITIES

External Advisory Group

Meeting #1

Friday, January 17, 2020
Today’s Agenda

• Welcome & introductions
• Purpose, roles, and ground rules
• Biometric technology 101 & potential use cases
• Seven principles for public-facing biometric technology
• Next steps
• Adjourn
Welcome & Introductions
Welcome & Introductions

• Name
• Preferred pronoun
• Organization
• Interest in developing policy for biometric technology
About BDS

A FEW EXEMPLARY & RELEVANT PROJECTS:

• Alaskan Way Viaduct Stakeholder Facilitation
• Downtown Seattle Association Strategic Plan
• Transportation Futures Task Force (PSRC)
• King County 911 Strategic Plan
• Seattle Waterfront Local Improvement District
• Communities of Opportunity
• Seattle Industrial & Maritime Strategy
## Roster

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dana Debel</td>
<td>Delta Air Lines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elizabeth Tauben</td>
<td>Norwegian Cruise Line Holdings (Norwegian Cruise Line &amp; Oceania Cruises)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer Lee</td>
<td>ACLU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer Thibodeau</td>
<td>Amazon Web Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McKenna Lux</td>
<td>CAIR-WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Balgent-Scales</td>
<td>Virgin Atlantic Airways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene Plenefisch</td>
<td>Microsoft Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jevin West</td>
<td>University of Washington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maggie Levay</td>
<td>Royal Caribbean (Royal Caribbean &amp; Celebrity Cruises)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nina Moses</td>
<td>US Transportation Security Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rich Stolz</td>
<td>One America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sasha Bernhard</td>
<td>Office of US Rep Suzan DelBene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott Kennedy</td>
<td>Alaska Airlines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheri Sawyer</td>
<td>Office of Washington State Governor Jay Inslee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzanne Juneau</td>
<td>Puget Sound Business Travel Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria Sipe</td>
<td>Holland America Group (Holland, Princess &amp; Seabourn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yazmin Medhl</td>
<td>Office of US Rep Pramila Jayapal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Purpose, Roles, Ground Rules
Purpose of Internal Working Group

• To deliver policy recommendations governing the use of public-facing biometric technology at Port facilities that balance:
  • Operational needs
  • Business priorities
  • Regulatory mandates
  • Protections for interests and rights of passengers, employees, and visitors to Port facilities

• Due to Commission by the end of 2\textsuperscript{nd} Quarter 2020
Role of *External* Advisory Group

- To advise and guide the *Internal Working Group*’s development of policies to govern public-facing biometric technology in Port operations
Role of **External** Advisory Group

- To advise and guide the *Internal Working Group’s* development of policies to govern public-facing biometric technology in Port operations

**Note:**
The Port does not strive for, nor expect, consensus as an outcome of this process.

The goal is to communicate various viewpoints and a range of options to the *Internal Working Group* and *Port Commission*. 
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dec</th>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>Feb</th>
<th>Mar</th>
<th>Apr</th>
<th>May</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>27</strong></td>
<td>10% recommendation</td>
<td>25% recommendation</td>
<td>50% recommendation</td>
<td>75% recommendation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTERNAL WORKING GROUP</strong></td>
<td>Kick-Off</td>
<td>Review current policies/processes and determine goals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EXTERNAL ADVISORY GROUP</strong></td>
<td>Discuss seven principles</td>
<td>Review internal working group recommendations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PORT COMMISSION</strong></td>
<td>Create Biometrics Committee</td>
<td>Update Commission at public meeting</td>
<td>Finalize policy recommendations (100%)</td>
<td>Commission reviews final policy recommendations</td>
<td>Biometrics Committee updates recommendations</td>
<td>Commission approves guidance on recommendations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Advisory Group Website

On December 30, the Port of Seattle Commission established guiding principles for the public-facing use of biometric technology at Port facilities. The next step in the Port’s process is to translate those principles into tangible, enforceable policies that will govern Port decision-making on this topic, which is due to Commission by March 31, 2020.

portseattle.org/page/biometrics-external-advisory-group
Ground Rules (informed by interviews)

- Respect others’ opinions
- Speak honestly
- Strive for equitable process
- Amplify the voices of marginalized groups
- Acknowledge organizational interests
- Ask questions for clarification
- Focus on sound & specific policy recommendations
- Focus on forward movement
- Avoid acronyms and jargon
- Avoid “tech-splaining”
- Track commitments & next steps
- Accept hands-on facilitation
Biometrics 101 & Use Cases

Port of Seattle staff
Review of Early Input

Key informant interviews, Commission meetings, and online survey
Review of Early Input: Baseline level of understanding

• Group members vary in level of technical and/or policy understanding, from medium to high understanding

• Commitment to further understanding the technology and learning to clarify misinformation
Concerns & Acknowledgements

Concerns:
• Use and application of technology
• Potential negative impact on marginalized communities
  • i.e., people of color, people with beards, people wearing headscarves, people with disabilities, etc.
• Racial profiling, mass surveillance, mismatched data, law enforcement access to data, etc.

Acknowledgements:
• Facial recognition technology can potentially benefit customer/user experience
  • Need to balance benefits with protecting people and information
• Biometrics, including facial recognition, is already deployed elsewhere and may result in more efficient processes.
Values around the table

Advisory group members bring many values to the table:

- Commitment to civil liberties, due process, and civil rights
- Racial equity in the consideration and application of biometrics
- Emphasis and value for community voice and lived experiences
- Transparency within the External Advisory Group, between the Internal Working Group, Commission, and the public
- Honesty about individual interests
- Technology should not infringe on individual rights
REVIEW OF EARLY INPUT:

Anticipated group dynamics

• Good opportunity to learn more about biometrics and build relationships

• Need to address misinformation or incomplete information

• Concern that tech industry cannot be neutral if trying to sell product and develop policy simultaneously

• Concern that External Advisory Group will not be equitable nor give disproportionate voice to marginalized groups
Review of Early Input: Top priorities for biometric principles

From interviews and an online survey, group members indicated that the following principles were most important to their constituents:

- Private
- Equitable
- Lawful
- Ethical
7 principles for public-facing biometric technology

Adopted by Port of Seattle Commission on 12/10/2019
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guiding Principles</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Justified</td>
<td>Should be used only for a clear and intended purpose and not for surveillance on large groups without a lawful purpose.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Should be stored for no longer than required by applicable law or regulations and should be protected against unauthorized access.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equitable</td>
<td>Should be reasonably accurate in identifying people of all backgrounds, and systems should be in place to treat mismatching issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparent</td>
<td>Should be communicated to visitors and travelers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawful</td>
<td>Should comply with all laws, including privacy laws and laws prohibiting discrimination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical</td>
<td>Should act ethically when deploying technology or handling biometric data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary</td>
<td>Should be voluntary and reasonable alternatives should be provided for those who do not wish to participate through an opt-in or opt-out process.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Definitions & Priorities

Please answer these questions for the 7 principles, with one sticky note per principle. Start with your top priorities.

1) What does this principle mean to your constituents?
2) Why is this principle important?

Post your comments on the wallgraphic when you are done.
Next Steps
Next Steps

• Internal Work Group meets on January 31 to develop 10% recommendations

• External Work Group meets on February 7 to review 10% recommendations